| 1 | | |
|----|--|--|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | BEFORE THE POLLUTION CONTROL HEARINGS BOARD IN AND FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | PUGET SOUNDKEEPER ALLIANCE, KING COUNTY, CITY OF TACOMA, | PCHB NO. 21-082c |
| 10 | WASHINGTON ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL, SUQUAMISH TRIBE, CITY OF | AMENDED STIPULATION FOR |
| 11 | EVERETT, CITY OF BREMERTON, BIRCH | PARTIAL STAY OF PUGET SOUND NUTRIENT GENERAL PERMIT |
| 12 | BAY WATER AND SEWER DISTRICT, ALDERWOOD WATER & WASTEWATER | |
| 13 | DISTRICT, PIERCE COUNTY, and CITY OF EDMONDS, | |
| 14 | Appellants, | |
| 15 | V. | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | STATE OF WASHINGTON, DEPARTMENT OF ECOLOGY, | |
| 18 | Respondent. | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | In this consolidated matter King County and City of Tacoma (Tacoma) filed appeals of | |
| 21 | the Puget Sound Nutrient General Permit (PSNGP) issued by the Department of Ecology | |
| 22 | (Ecology) on December 1, 2021. King County and Tacoma additionally filed separate motions to | |
| 23 | stay the PSNGP under RCW 43.21B.320. The cities of Bremerton, Edmonds, Everett, the Birch | |
| 24 | Bay Water and Sewer District, and Alderwood Water & Wastewater District separately filed | |
| 25 | notices of appeal that included requests to stay the PSNGP. Pierce County by participating in | |
| 26 | this stipulation also requests a partial stay of the permit as set forth in this stipulation. King | |
| I | П | Tunner Mack Wells PLLC |

County and Tacoma have conferred with Ecology and separately conferred with the other
 permittee appellants on the terms of this stipulation.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

21

22

23

Based on those consultations, the parties to this stipulation have agreed to the following partial stay of the PSNGP which will fully resolve the pending motions for a stay. Ecology has agreed to, and does hereby, exercise its authority under RCW 43.21B.310(1) to the following partial stay of the PSNGP pending the Board's resolution of the appeals in this matter.

 Special Condition S3 – Compliance with Standards - shall be stayed in its entirety pending the Board's resolution of the appeals in this matter.

2. Optimization requirements in Special Conditions S4.C.3, S5.C.3, S6.B.2.b require evaluation of opportunities to reduce TIN loads. The conditions do not require permittees to consider optimization strategies that reduce the volume of septage or influent to the subject facilities, impose building moratoria, or require significant operational changes that would reduce treatment capacity at the facilities.

3. Special Conditions S4.D.2 and S5.D.2 – Action Level Exceedance Corrective Actions
– are stayed in their entirety pending the Board's resolution of the appeals in this matter. The
parties to this stipulation agree that in the event monitoring data collected during this stay
indicates an exceedance of an action level in accordance with S4.D.2.a or S5.D.2.b, the deadline
for submitting a proposed approach to reduce the annual effluent load will be with the Annual
report due in the year following the year in which this stay is lifted or otherwise no longer in
effect, but in no event earlier than March 31, 2024.

4. The requirement for King County to elect whether to apply individual or bubbled action levels for each of its facilities pursuant to Special Condition S4.B is stayed until July 1, 2022. King County may change its selection in the report required in Special Condition S4.C.2.

5. Reporting requirements under Special Condition S.9 for Action Level Exceedance
Corrective Actions stayed under paragraph 3, and provisions in, General Condition G.1 related
to Action Level Exceedance Corrective Actions stayed under paragraph 3 are stayed pending the

| 1 | Board's resolution of the appeals in this matter. | | |
|----|---|--|--|
| 2 | 6. The parties to this stipulation do not waive or concede any claims or defenses in the | | |
| 3 | PSNGP consolidated appeals as to lawfulness and reasonableness of the PSNGP or the specific | | |
| 4 | conditions of the PSNGP that are the subject of this stipulation. | | |
| 5 | Respectfully submitted this 14th day of January 2022. | | |
| 6 | | | |
| 7 | DEPARTMENT OF ECOLOGY | | |
| 8 | <i>s/ Vincent McGowan</i> Vincent McGowan, P.E. | | |
| 9 | Water Quality Program Manager | | |
| 10 | TUPPER MACK WELLS PLLC | ROBERT W. FERGUSON Attorney General | |
| 11 | s/James A. Tupper, Jr. | | |
| 12 | James A. Tupper, Jr. WSBA No. 16873 | <u>s/ Ronald L. Lavigne</u> Ronald L. Lavigne, WSBA No. 18550 | |
| 13 | Attorneys for the Cities of Tacoma, Bremerton and Everett | Senior Counsel | |
| 14 | CITY OF TACOMA | <u>s/ Sonia A. Wolfman</u> Sonia A. Wolfman, WSBA No. 30510 | |
| 15 | William C. Fosbre | Assistant Attorney General | |
| 16 | City Attorney | Attorneys for State of Washington, | |
| 17 | s/Christopher D. Bacha | Department of Ecology | |
| 18 | Christopher D. Bacha, WSBA No. 16714 Chief Deputy City Attorney | | |
| 19 | Attorneys for the City of Tacoma | | |
| 20 | STOEL RIVES LLP | FOSTER GARVEY PC | |
| 21 | <u>s/Beth S. Ginsberg.</u> | <u>s/Lori A. Terry</u> | |
| 22 | Beth S. Ginsberg, WSBA No. 18523 Michael R. Campbell, WSBA No. 55300 | Lori A. Terry, WSBA #22006 Devra R. Cohen, WSBA # 49952 | |
| 23 | King County Prosecuting Attorney's Office | Attorneys for Pierce County | |
| 24 | s/Verna P. Bromley. | | |
| 25 | Verna P. Bromley, WSBA No. 24703 Michael Graves, WSBA No. 52632 | | |
| 26 | Attorneys for King County | | |
| | STIPULATION FOR PARTIAL STAY OF PSNGP | Tupper Mack Wells PLLC2025 First Avenue, Suite 11003Seattle, Washington 98121TEL 206.493.2300 FAX 206.493.2310 | |

| 1 2 3 | CITY OF BREMERTON Kylie Finnell City Attorney | CITY OF EVERETT David Hall City Attorney |
|--------------|---|---|
| 4 5 | <u>s/Brett M. Jette</u> Brett M. Jette, WSBA No. 47903 Assistant City Attorney | <u>s/ Timothy D. Benedict</u> Timothy D. Benedict, WSBA No. 30378 Deputy City Attorney |
| 6 | Attorney for the City of Bremerton | Attorney for the City of Everett |
| 7 | LIGHTHOUSE LAW GROUP PLLC | CARMICHAEL CLARK PS |
| 8 9 10 | <u>s/ Beth Ford</u> Jeffrey Taraday, WSBA No. 28182 Sharon Cates, WSBA No. 29273 Beth Ford, WSBA No. 44208 | <u>s/Robert A. Carmichael</u> Robert A. Carmichael Catherine Moore Attorneys for Birch Bay Water and Sewer |
| 11 | Attorneys for the City of Edmonds | District |
| 12 | HENDRICKS-BENNETT, PLLC | |
| 13 | s/Joseph P. Bennett | |
| 14 | Joseph P. Bennett, WSBA No. 20893 | |
| 15 16 | Attorneys for Alderwood Water & Wastewater District | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| | - | Tunnar Mack Walls PLL |

4

| 1 | DECLARATION OF SERVICE | | |
|----|---|---|--|
| 2 | I declare on oath that on this date I filed the foregoing document with the Pollution | | |
| 3 | Control Hearings Board by delivering a copy via electronic mail and by sending the original via | | |
| 4 | U.S. mail, postage paid, addressed as follows: | | |
| 5 | Pollution Control Hearings Board | | |
| 6 | P.O. Box 40903 Olympia, WA 98504-0903 | | |
| 7 | eluho@eluho.wa.gov | | |
| 8 | I further declare that I served a copy of the foregoing document via email upon the | | |
| 9 | parties listed as follows: | | |
| 10 | | | |
| 11 | Janette Brimmer Marisa C. Ordonia | Ronald Lavigne, Senior Counsel Sonia Wolfman, Asst. Attorney General | |
| 12 | Earthjustice 810 Third Avenue, Suite 610 | Office of the AG – Ecology Division P.O. Box 40117 | |
| 13 | Seattle, WA 98104 | Olympia, WA 98504 | |
| 14 | jbrimmer@earthjustice.org mordonia@earthjustice.org | Ronald.lavigne@atg.wa.gov sonia.wolfman@atg.wa.gov | |
| 15 | ahinz@earthjustice.org | donna.fredricks@atg.wa.gov ecyolyef@atg.wa.gov | |
| 16 | Verre Dremley | | |
| 17 | Verna Bromley Michael Graves | Beth Ginsberg Michael Campbell | |
| 18 | King County Prosecuting Attorney's Office 1191 Second Avenue, Suite 1700 | Stoel Rives LLP600 University Street, Suite 3600 | |
| 19 | Seattle, WA 98101 Verna.Bromley@kingcounty.gov | Seattle, WA 98101 beth.ginsberg@stoel.com; | |
| 20 | mgraves@kingcounty.gov | michael.campbell@stoel.com | |
| 20 | Wyatt Golding | Melody Allen | |
| | Brian C. Gruber Ziontz Chestnut | The Suquamish Tribe Office of Tribal Attorney 18490 Suquamish Way | |
| 22 | 2101 Fourth Avenue, Suite 1230 | P.O. Box 498 | |
| 23 | Seattle, WA 98121 wgolding@ziontzchestnut.com | Suquamish, WA 98392 mallen@suquamish.nsn.us | |
| 24 | bgruber@ziontzchestnut.com chazzard@ziontzchestnut.com | | |
| 25 | | | |
| 26 | | Tunner Meek Wells DLLC | |

| 1 | Leng C. Star lange | Lessel D. Dennett |
|----|--|--|
| 1 | Jane G. Steadman Kanji & Katzen, PLLC | Joseph P. Bennett Hendricks-Bennett, PLLC |
| 2 | 811 First Avenue, Suite 630 | 402 Fifth Avenue South |
| 3 | Seattle, WA 98104 | Edmonds, WA 98020 |
| 3 | jsteadman@kanjikatzen.com | joe@hendricksb.com |
| 4 | | |
| _ | Timothy D. Benedict | Brett M. Jette |
| 5 | City of Everett | City of Bremerton |
| 6 | 2930 Wetmore Avenue, Suite 10-C | 345 6th Street, Suite 100 |
| | Everett, WA 98120 | Bremerton, WA 98337 |
| 7 | tbenedict@everettwa.gov | brett.jette@ci.bremerton.wa.us |
| 8 | Robert A. Carmichael | Sharon Cates |
| | Catherine Moore | Beth Ford |
| 9 | Carmichael Clark PS | Jeffrey Taraday |
| 10 | 1700 D Street | Lighthouse Law Group PLLC |
| | P.O. Box 5226 | 600 Stewart Street, Suite 400 |
| 11 | Bellingham, WA 98227 | Seattle, WA 98101 |
| 12 | Bob@CarmichaelClark.com | sharon@lighthouselawgroup.com |
| 12 | CMoore@carmichaelclark.com TBaker@carmichaelclark.com | beth@lighthouselawgroup.com jeff@lighthouselawgroup.com |
| 13 | TMaloy@carmichaelclark.com | Jent@lighthouselawgroup.com |
| 14 | Twatoy@carmenacterark.com | |
| 14 | Lori A. Terry | Christopher D. Bacha |
| 15 | Devra R. Cohen | City of Tacoma |
| | Foster Garvey PC | 747 Market St Room 1120 |
| 16 | 1111 Third Avenue, Suite 3000 | Tacoma WA 98402 |
| 17 | Seattle, WA 98101 | cbacha@cityoftacoma.org |
| 1, | devra.cohen@foster.com | |
| 18 | lori.terry@foster.com | |
| 19 | Shbien.Cross@Foster.com | |
| 20 | Signed at Spattle Weakington this 1 | Ath day of January 2022 |
| | Signed at Seattle, Washington, this 14 | |
| 21 | | <u>s/ Susan Barragan</u> Susan Barragan, Legal Assistant |
| 22 | | Susan Darragan, Legar Assistant |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | 4891-5927-2210, v. 1 | |
| 25 | | |
| | | |
| 26 | | |
| | STIPULATION FOR PARTIAL STAY OF PSNGP | 6 Tupper Mack Wells PLLC 2025 First Avenue, Suite 1100 Seattle, Washington 98121 TEL 206.493.2300 FAX 206.493.2310 |